
JUSTIFICATION STATEMENT FOR SHORT LISTING

University of Utah

Utah Museum of Natural History – Programming Selection

DFCM Project No. 02243750

The UMNH selection committee was very impressed with each of the submitters and expresses its appreciation to them for their efforts and interest in the project.

From the firms that submitted proposals for the programming solicitation, the selection committee resolved to short-list E. Verner Johnson and Associates, Lord Cultural Resources, MHTN Architects, Prescott Muir Architects, and the Smith Group to proceed to the interview phase of this selection.

The selection committee identified the following characteristics of the successful proposals that justify the short-listing:

- Each submitter assembled teams that offered extensive experience in similar project types;
- Demonstrated experience with projects of similar scope and type;
- Each submitter offered strong collaboration with project stakeholders;
- Each team understood their responsibility in working as a consultant with project facilitator;
- Understanding of schedule;
- Identification of project risks and submittal of proposals to mitigate or to eliminate risks;
- Each submitter offered project-specific responses from the management plans.

VALUE BASED CONSULTANT SHORT LISTING

UTAH MUSEUM OF NATURAL HISTORY
DFCM PROJECT NO.: 02243750

31 MARCH 2003

| Track II: Programming - Score Sheet | A | | | | | B | | | | | C * | | | | | D | | | | | E | | | | | |
|---|-----|---|-----|---|---|-----|---|-----|-----|---|-----|-----|-----|---|---|-----|---|---|-----|---|-----|---|-----|---|---|--|
| Strength of Team | 3 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 5 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 4 | 3 | 2 | |
| Project Management Approach | 3 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 3 | |
| Schedule | 4 | 2 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 5 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 2 | 2 | 5 | 3 | 2 | 3 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 2 | |
| Programming excellence as evidenced by past work. | 3.5 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4.5 | 4 | 3 | 3.5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 4 | 3 | 3.5 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 2 | |
| Experience with projects of similar scope and scale and adequate professional experience to meet the requirements of the the project. | 3.5 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 2 | 5 | 5 | 2 | 3.5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 3 | 5 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 4.5 | 3 | 2 | |
| Experience with facilitating and coordinating staff, board, and community input. | 3 | 5 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4.5 | 4 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 4.5 | 5 | 4 | 3 | 5 | 4 | 3.5 | 3 | 3 | 5 | 4 | 4 | 2 | |
| Experience with technology and sustainable building concepts. | 3 | 2 | 1 | 4 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 4.5 | 4 | 2 | 3 | 3 | 4.5 | 5 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 1 | 4 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 3 | |
| Experience working with exhibit planning and design to achieve integrated building and exhibit design plans. | 3 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 5 | 4 | 1 | 2 | 5 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 1 | 3.5 | 3 | 2 | 3 | 4.5 | 3 | 2 | |
| Experience in phased projects. | 2 | 1 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 5 | 4 | 1 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 1 | 4.5 | 4 | 2 | |
| Ability to work with HEWV on site analysis. | 2 | 2 | 1 | 4 | | 2 | 3 | 4 | 3.5 | | 2 | 3 | 4.5 | 4 | | 2 | 2 | 1 | 3.5 | | 3 | 2 | 4.5 | 4 | | |
| Track II: Programming - Score Sheet | F * | | | | | G * | | | | | H * | | | | | I * | | | | | | | | | | |
| Strength of Team | 4 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 2 | 3.5 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | | | | | |
| Project Management Approach | 3.5 | 5 | 4.5 | 5 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 2 | 5 | 3 | 3.5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3.5 | 4 | 2 | 3 | 3 | | | | | | |
| Schedule | 3.5 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 1 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 1 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 5 | 4 | 3 | | | | | | |
| Programming excellence as evidenced by past work. | 4.5 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 3 | 4.5 | 5 | 3 | 5 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 3.5 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 4 | | | | | | |
| Experience with projects of similar scope and scale and adequate professional experience to meet the requirements of the the project. | 4 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 3 | 5 | 4 | 3.5 | 3 | 5 | 4 | 3 | 3.5 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4 | | | | | | |
| Experience with facilitating and coordinating staff, board, and community input. | 4 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 3 | 3.5 | 4 | 3 | 5 | 2 | 3 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 2 | 5 | 3 | | | | | | |
| Experience with technology and sustainable building concepts. | 4 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 1 | 4 | 3.5 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 4.5 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 4 | | | | | | |
| Experience working with exhibit planning and design to achieve integrated building and exhibit design plans. | 3.5 | 3 | 4.5 | 4 | 2 | 3.5 | 5 | 3 | 5 | 3 | 3 | 1 | 4 | 5 | 2 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 5 | 4 | | | | | | |
| Experience in phased projects. | 3.5 | 2 | 5 | 4 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 3 | 3.5 | 3 | 5 | 4 | 3 | 4 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 3 | | | | | | |
| Ability to work with HEWV on site analysis. | 3.5 | 5 | 5 | 5 | | 3.5 | 3 | 2 | 5 | | 4 | 4 | 4 | 5 | | 3 | 3 | 2 | 2 | | | | | | | |

An asterisk (*) denotes a short-listed team